



National Transportation Safety Board Aviation Accident Data Summary

Location:	Lubbock, TX	Accident Number:	CEN09MA142
Date & Time:	01/27/2009, 0437 CST	Registration:	N902FX
Aircraft:	AEROSPATIALE ALENIA ATR 42-320	Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 121: Air Carrier - Non-scheduled		

Analysis

The Safety Board's full report is available at http://www.nts.gov/Publictn/A_Acc1.htm. The Aircraft Accident Report number is NTSB/AAR-11/02.

On January 27, 2009, about 0437 central standard time, an Avions de Transport Régional Aerospatiale Alenia ATR 42 320, N902FX, operating as Empire Airlines flight 8284, was on an instrument approach when it crashed short of the runway at Lubbock Preston Smith International Airport, Lubbock, Texas. The captain sustained serious injuries, and the first officer sustained minor injuries. The airplane was substantially damaged. The airplane was registered to Federal Express Corporation and operated by Empire Airlines, Inc., as a 14 Code of Federal Regulations Part 121 supplemental cargo flight. The flight departed from Fort Worth Alliance Airport, Fort Worth, Texas, about 0313. Instrument meteorological conditions prevailed, and an instrument flight rules flight plan was filed.

Flight Events

Approach-IFR final approach - Collision with terr/obj (non-CFIT)
Approach-IFR initial approach - Aerodynamic stall/spin

Probable Cause

The National Transportation Safety Board determines the probable cause(s) of this accident to be: The flight crew's failure to monitor and maintain a minimum safe airspeed while executing an instrument approach in icing conditions, which resulted in an aerodynamic stall at low altitude. Contributing to the accident were 1) the flight crew's failure to follow published standard operating procedures in response to a flap anomaly, 2) the captain's decision to continue with the unstabilized approach, 3) the flight crew's poor crew resource management, and 4) fatigue due to the time of day in which the accident occurred and a cumulative sleep debt, which likely impaired the captain's performance.

Findings

Aircraft-Aircraft oper/perf/capability-Performance/control parameters-Airspeed-Not attained/maintained - C

Personnel issues-Task performance-Use of equip/info-Aircraft control-Flight crew - C

Personnel issues-Action/decision-Action-Incorrect action performance-Pilot - F

Personnel issues-Action/decision-Info processing/decision-(general)-Flight crew - F

Personnel issues-Physical-Alertness/Fatigue-Lack of sleep-Pilot - F

Personnel issues-Physical-Alertness/Fatigue-Circadian rhythms or jetlag-Pilot - F
 Personnel issues-Task performance-Communication (personnel)-CRM/MRM techniques-Flight crew
 - F
 Environmental issues-Conditions/weather/phenomena-Ceiling/visibility/precip-Freezing rain/sleet-
 Effect on equipment

Pilot Information

Certificate:	Airline Transport; Commercial	Age:	52
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Instructor Rating(s):	
Flight Time:	13200 hours (Total, all aircraft)		

Co-Pilot Information

Certificate:	Flight Instructor; Commercial	Age:	26
Airplane Rating(s):	Multi-engine Land; Single-engine Land	Instrument Rating(s):	Airplane
Other Aircraft Rating(s):	None	Instructor Rating(s):	Airplane Multi-engine; Airplane Single-engine
Flight Time:	2000 hours (Total, all aircraft)		

Aircraft and Owner/Operator Information

Aircraft Make:	AEROSPATIALE ALENIA	Registration:	N902FX
Model/Series:	ATR 42-320	Engines:	2 Turbo Prop
Operator:	Empire Airlines	Engine Manufacturer:	Pratt and Whitney Canada
Operating Certificate(s) Held:	Supplemental	Engine Model/Series:	PW 121
Flight Conducted Under:	Part 121: Air Carrier - Non-scheduled		

Meteorological Information and Flight Plan

Conditions at Accident Site:	Instrument Conditions	Condition of Light:	Night/Dark
Observation Facility, Elevation:	LBB, 3282 ft msl	Weather Information Source:	Weather Observation Facility
Lowest Ceiling:	Overcast / 500 ft agl	Wind Speed/Gusts, Direction:	10 knots / , 350°
Temperature:	8° C	Visibility	2 Miles
Precipitation and Obscuration:	Light - Freezing - Drizzle; Mist		
Departure Point:	Fort Worth, TX (AFW)	Destination:	Lubbock, TX (LBB)

Airport Information

Airport:	Lubbock Preston Smith (LBB)	Runway Surface Type:	Concrete
Runway Used:	17R	Runway Surface Condition:	Ice; Wet
Runway Length/Width:	11500 ft / 150 ft		

Wreckage and Impact Information

Crew Injuries:	1 Serious, 1 Minor	Aircraft Damage:	Substantial
Passenger Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Fire:	On-Ground
Ground Injuries:	N/A	Aircraft Explosion:	On-Ground
Latitude, Longitude:	33.658056, -101.820278 (est)		

Administrative Information

Investigator In Charge (IIC):	Leah D Yeager	Adopted Date:	04/26/2011
Investigation Docket:	NTSB accident and incident docket serve as permanent archival information for the NTSB's investigations. Dockets released prior to June 1, 2009 are publicly available from the NTSB's Record Management Division at pubinq@ntsb.gov , or at 800-877-6799. Dockets released after this date are available at http://dms.nts.gov/pubdms/ .		

The National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), established in 1967, is an independent federal agency mandated by Congress through the Independent Safety Board Act of 1974 to investigate transportation accidents, determine the probable causes of the accidents, issue safety recommendations, study transportation safety issues, and evaluate the safety effectiveness of government agencies involved in transportation. The NTSB makes public its actions and decisions through accident reports, safety studies, special investigation reports, safety recommendations, and statistical reviews.

The Independent Safety Board Act, as codified at 49 U.S.C. Section 1154(b), precludes the admission into evidence or use of any part of an NTSB report related to an incident or accident in a civil action for damages resulting from a matter mentioned in the report.